Offer: A. Bace
2nd: M Glackin
Date: 4/18/2013

Minutes of APRIL 4, 2013

The Regular Meeting of the Hazlet Township Planning Board of Adjustment scheduled for March 7, 2013 was called to order at 7:30 PM with a Salute to the Flag followed by a Moment of Silent Prayer and a Reading of the Letter of Compliance.

ROLL CALL:
Present: Mr. Glackin, Mr. Vignola, Mr. DeMatteo, Mr. Bace, Mr. Tyler, Deputy Mayor DiNardo, Mayor Belasco, Mr. Lavan

Absent: Deputy Mayor DiNardo, Mayor Belasco, Mr. Solomeno, Mr.

Professionals: Mr. Vella, Esq., Mr. Kittner, Jr. P.E. in attendance

MOTION: To approve the Minutes of the Regular Meeting of March 7, 2013

Offered by: Mr. Vignola 2nd Mr. Lavan

Roll Call:	Yes	Absent:
Mr. Glackin	☒	☐
Mr. Pobega (abstain)	☐	☐
Mr. Vignola	☒	☐
Mr. DeMatteo	☒	☐
Mr. Mann	☐	☒
Mr. Bace	☒	☐
Chairman Mr. Tyler	☒	☐
Deputy Mayor DiNardo	☐	☒
Mayor Belasco	☐	☒
Alt #1 Mr. Lavan	☒	☐
Alt #2 Mr. Solomeno	☐	☒

New Case: 13-01P Costco Wholesale Corp. LLC Block 192 Lot (s) 1, 1.01 & 3 2835-2847 Highway 35. Applicant is requesting an Amended Preliminary and Final Site Plan to permit deliveries to the existing wholesale warehouse between the hours of 5 am and 10 pm, where the previous approval associated with the site permitted 6am and 6pm.

Attorney Vella- We did notice the adjoined property owners and Affidavit of Service. The board has jurisdiction to hear this matter.

Matthew Schiller with the Law firm of K&L Gates representing Costco Wholesale Corp. Costco has submitted this application to amend its prior site plan approval from 2001. In which one of the conditions of the approval was to limit the hours of truck deliveries from 6AM-6PM. Costco at this point in time has experienced a fundamental shift in its overall business and product line over the past decade. As a result of that and as a result of its current business sees the current hour restraints as a quite frankly a public safety issue for its own employees as a result of this stacking and queuing of products in the rear of the Costco. Also it inhibits the ability for Costco to be able to put its products out on its shelves on a daily basis. Tonight we have Mike Liszewski the store manager of Costco. It is located at 2835 Route 35 North and it is approximately a 25 acre lot. There is also a Bertucci's on the lot and it is bordered by residential properties to the east and to the north. Again, the Costco restrictions add issue was a condition of a site plan approval when Costco made a 18,250 sq. foot expansion in 2001. This was condition number 4 of the resolution of approval at that point in time. Costco has been complying with this condition to date over the past decade. Prior to that time Costco had truck deliveries occurring on site we believe between the hours of 6am and 11pm. Last year a preliminary and final site plan approval was granted with variances in order to construct a 1,152 dairy cooler and a 10 ft x30 ft. equipment house in the loading area of the building. Costco has put those plans on hold while they are considering internal modifications. No other site improvements are proposed at this time. The only thing they are proposing right now is to expand the permitted hours of deliveries on site. Costco can only stock shelves in the morning before store opens and in the evening after

hours of operation. The forklifts and other heavy machinery to be able to move their products and to stock their shelves. As are result Costco as Mr. Liszewski will testify is extremely limited in hours that it actually has to place products on the shelves. Products are just sitting there over the course of the day until the customer hour's close and store employees are able to restock the shelves.

Mr. DeMatteo- This queuing and stacking of product is that in anyway inhibiting the storage area and freezer you spoke about?

Attorney Schiller- That is completely separate issue they do not impact each other in the least at this point and time. Mr. Liszewski with testify the increased hours of truck deliveries will enable Costco employees to affectively roll products onto the shelves especially in the early morning hours where they get fresh dairy products and other grocery products. I also have Keith Cahill of Bolger Engineering in the event you have any site operations, questions or concerns.

Calling Mike Liszewski Costco store manager to provide a more detailed description in terms of the need for this request tonight. (Attorney Vella swearing in Mr. Liszewski).

Attorney Schiller- Please describe to the board your current occupation with Costco?

Mr. Liszewski- I am the warehouse manager of the Hazlet store.

Attorney Schiller- How long have you been serving in that function?

Mr. Liszewski- Just over 3 ½ years.

Attorney Schiller- Prior to that were you working at other Costco facilities?

Mr. Liszewski- Yes I have been employed in 9 other locations throughout my 21 years.

Attorney Schiller- In what capacities?

Mr. Liszewski- I started from the ground up and worked my to warehouse manager. Every capacity 1997 through present.

Attorney Schiller-Have each of the Costco's you worked at had similar hour restrictions in terms of delivery schedules.

Mr. Liszewski- No this is the only one with hour restrictions.

Attorney Schiller- Other locations give examples?

Mr. Liszewski- Location can receive from the hours of 4am up until as close to 9:45AM. My location cuts off at 8:30 am so we have enough time to pick everything up. Problems we face with the 6AM restriction are when my employees come in we can only unload trailers from 6am run off the dock to the sales floor up until about 8:30 which only gives us about 2 ½ hours to get everything as cleared off the dock as we can. Stock shelves and do everything else and still be ready for operation. If we had that extra hour we could probably get another 2 trailers off which is about120 palettes off the dock instead of sitting back on the receiving area.

Mr. DeMatteo- After 8:30 in the morning what happens with the all the deliveries that occur on site during the day.

Mr. Liszewski- It all gets staged on receiving dock. It sometimes gets 4 high 15-20 wide.

Attorney Schiller- Please tell the board what time you open and close.

Mr. Liszewski- We open to all members at 9:45 am Monday –Friday. 9:15 am on Saturdays and 9:45 am on Sundays. We close at 8:30pm Monday-Friday, at 6PM on Saturday –Sunday.

Attorney Schiller- Briefly describe what happens after store closes with respect to all products?

Mr. Liszewski- At 8:30 PM once we lock the doors we then start to unload what we have stocked up for the day and then run that out to the floor.

Attorney Schiller- Can you please describe to the board the primary problem in what has been resulting as a result of the limiting hours in which this Costco facility can't accept deliveries.

Mr. Liszewski- I can only speak from experience I have had 8 different locations under my belt. When you are forced to stop receiving at 6pm you don't have any afternoon time to unload any freight. In all the other locations I have been in you can receive all the way through 10-11 pm. We are missing out on the opportunity where our trucks have to be in our doors at 5 o'clock so they can get them unloaded so they can be out of the zone. We have to off load the trailer then stage it and stock it up then the trailer can leave. If it was later we would be able to off load the trailers and run them out to floor to be stocked.

Attorney Schiller- You would be able to unload a sufficiently greater amount of product early during the day. In your opinion do the current hour restrictions impact the health and safety of your employees in anyway?

Mr. Liszewski- It definitely impacts the safety. 7-8 tractor trailers backed in at the same time and trying to unload them, run them to the floor and replenish the store and get it swept and clean and put all the freight back up one hour would make a significant difference.

Attorney Schiller- Per day per average how many deliveries occur on site?

Mr. Liszewski- About 12-13 tractor trailer loads a day. We also receive small box trucks and if you add them all together it is probably about 20 a day.

Mr. DeMatteo- How would those trucks be spaced out with the extended period of time?

Mr. Liszewski- You can only receive about two trucks an hour. If we were to go from 5-6 Am we would probably have about 2 additional trailers to come through. Generally the trailers that are there are usually Poland Spring and our own brand that comes through. The vendors come from up north, Maine, New Hampshire to run those loads down here. By getting them in an hour earlier would help streamline the process instead of getting backed up with another 2-3 trailers. It would give us the extra time to run that stuff off the floor.

Mr. DeMatteo- You are still going to have a significant amount of products sitting in the back there because you are only taking two extra trucks early if I am understanding you correctly.

Mr. Liszewski- There is about 60 palettes to a trailer, 120 palettes is the difference. It would be 120 less palettes that we have time to run through.

Attorney Schiller- What time do the employees show up in the morning to start unloading the deliveries?

Mr. Liszewski- My early shift shows up at 4:15 am and the receiving department comes in at 6am to start unloading the trucks.

Attorney Schiller- So you would have employees effectively on site ready to go basically going from truck to floor.

Mr. Liszewski- Correct.

Attorney Schiller- That would effectively eliminate an hours' worth of queuing that currently takes place.

Mr. Liszewski- Yes.

Attorney Schiller- The Poland Springs trucks you said was direct delivery from Maine & New Hampshire down to the stores site.

Mr. Liszewski- Correct.

Attorney Schiller- Typically speaking when do those trucks actually arrive on the site.

Mr. Liszewski- A lot of them arrive the night before. (showing board where the trucks park).

Attorney Vella- Marked as "A1" mounted color site plan.

Mr. Liszewski- Typically speaking before the hours of 6am they can park where they want.

Mr. DeMatteo- Are those trucks running idle?

Mr. Liszewski- If we see them running we tell them to turn them off unless they show up after midnight and no one is in the building.

Mr. Pobega- What was the condition in 2001 that had the planning board concerned that would restrict the hours that you could operate and made you agree to those hours 12 years ago?

Attorney Schiller- None of us where present in 2001.

Attorney Vella- (Reading a statement from 2001) There were concerns about truck activity on the site and parking overnight.

Mr. Schiller- If you look at condition number 4 all that is stated is there will be no truck delivery permitted between the hours of 6pm-6am.

Mr. Pobega- Where was the extension in 2001 was it to the north of the facility that was generating the concern? So it was on the end that was not even facing residential hazardous per say. There is a pretty good buffer to the back of the facility.

Mr.. DeMatteo- Does another time like 6-8pm work for your compromise on the 10pm.

Attorney Schiller- The morning 5am hour delivery is critical because of produce, milk, etc.

Mr. Lavan- Is it an enclosed dock are you using electric high lows or gas high lows with the beepers backing up. I think that this problem people have with the 5am start time.

Chairman Tyler-We have an ordinance in place and you have agreed to the hours and we need to hear from the folks as far as what is important to them. We want to make sure we accommodate you but we have to do in the context of what is right for everybody.

Mr. Pobega- Have there been any serious injuries or any injuries to talk about from the stacking of the products in the back of the store?

Mr. Liszewski- We have had products fall but thankfully no one has been injured at this time.

Mr. Bace- What is the buffer between the back of the store and Fleetwood Drive?

Attorney Schiller- The best thing to do would have Keith Cahill of Bohler Engineering go through the site layout in more detail.

Mr. Glackin – Do you continue to unload trucks until they are done or do they have to wait until the night shift to finish their unloading.

Mr. Liszewski- We plan enough so we can have them done by 6PM.

Attorney Schiller- Can you describe the unloading process when a truck arrives?

Mr. Liszewski- When a truck arrives the driver comes into loading holding cell where he give keys to receiving secretary after they chalk their wheels (obviously the truck is turned off) he waits until we unload the truck. We have battery operated fork lift that will unload all palettes. It can take 35-40 minutes to unload a trailer.

Attorney Vella- Swearing in Mr. Cahill from Bohler Engineering.

Mr. Bohler- Clarify one point there is no external loading dock. The forklifts are internal to the building. When the truck is against the building there is no external noise with a forklift. Everything is inside the building. The ramp goes in and it is tight against it and all activity is from inside the building.

Mr. DeMatteo- Have you received any resident complaints about noise previously?

Mr. Liszewski- No not since I have been there.

Mr. Glackin – Can the water be delivered at 10pm.

Mr. Liszewski- It can but then when we run out during the day there won' t be any water to replenish. Our night crew that we have there is pretty much for the service industry where they actually help out members. We don't do a lot of stocking at night.

Mr. Glackin- If there is going to be any flexibility it would probably be better at back end.

Mr. Bace- When you close at 8:30 PM you have a night shift and they work until what time?

Mr. Liszewski- That is correct they work until 11PM.

Mr. Cahill- A1 for reference on the site you are familiar with the Costco building and Route 35 from top to bottom. The access points as described the tractor trailers that enter the site typically coming from Route 35 and the jug handle coming from Millers Lane and enter this site at our main entrance and utilize the eastern driveways. At this location in the north east corner there is a sign that says no trucks between the hours of 6pm and 6am. They are allowed between 6am and 6pm. The Poland Spring trucks often show up before 6am. They may show up between 3am - 6am and they queue in this area one or two of the trucks. The request to go to the 5am is that those trucks can come in and deliver (which is centered at the rear of the building at the northern face). Those vehicles can then come in and get off loaded in that extra hour. The concern is that the hours when the employees are in the building the produce that comes off the trailer stays in the stock room. This does not happen at other Costco's.

Mr. Bace- Other Costcos' are they bigger units, bigger storage areas or bigger warehouses.

Mr. Cahill- Typically they don't have that area in the back because it is not required. They are going to take delivery directly out onto the floor. Why they are looking for the hours to be expanded is the real benefits comes when the customers are not in the building. Getting from 6pm-8:30 pm does not give us a big benefit because we still can't off load it and take it right to the shelves. Benefit comes after 8:30 PM when the customers leave. Now we can take it from the truck to the shelves and it is not being stacked.

Mr. DeMatteo- Has this always been a problem since the restriction went in place or did we start bringing in additional produce that is causing problem?

Mr. Cahill- From a decade ago until today they are taking in more trucks then they did back then.

Mr. Pobega – Is there just one loading dock for the store?

Mr. Cahill- There are six doors in the back.

Mr. DeMatteo- Are any of those docks going to be lost due to the expansion in the back with refrigeration?

Mr. Cahill- No.

Chairman Tyler- Are there six active doors or four active doors?

Mr. Liszewski- We actually have one door that is always used for a trailer that we have in house but the other five are for all the trailers that come in.

Chairman Tyler- So there are five active doors.

Mr. Liszewski- Correct.

Mr. DeMatteo – Has Costco looked into modifying inside the building to accommodate a larger storage area?

Mr. Liszewski- Not to our knowledge. We are one of the smaller locations. We are 130,000 square feet the average Costco is 147,000 square feet.

Mr. Bace- The back of store and Fleetwood that small strip is how big?

Mr. Cahill- The closest dock to Fleetwood is 300 feet away. As you go from the edge of our pavement this is an additional 125 feet that is the landscaped area. If you recall there is a 10 ft high berm with a board on board fence on top of it and a double row of pines planted on top of it.

Attorney Schiller – Would it be your testimony given the buffering and the distance available between the residence and Costco site that a light glow would not be an issue.

Mr. Cahill- Definitely not an issue.

Attorney Schiller- In your opinion the only noise that would ever be emanated as a result of the trucks would be the very brief 2-3 minute period maximum in which the trucks would simply be backing into the loading dock.

Mr. Cahill-Correct.

Mr. Pobega- How long does it take to unload 56-60 palettes from one trailer.

Mr. Liszewski- It depends on the delivery. It would be about ½ hour. Then there is another truck waiting.

Mr. Glackin- Mr. Vella is it possible just so we know what is available to us. Is it possible to create a resolution that would give expiration if the board wanted to try this out as a trial run?

Attorney Vella- You can't really do a trial run condition. You can give them some increased time during certain parts of the year where they are more busy and more need for the early morning. The board can grant relief on the existing condition if they feel it is appropriate. Apparently they are asking for four extra hours on the back end that they stop getting deliveries now. If they have 3 or 4 more hours of deliveries during the later of the day if between 6-8:45 PM all those contents would be stacked in the rooms into the waiting area and then can be placed on the shelves at night with the night crew or in the morning. With the trucks that come after 8:45 pm they can potentially be taken right off the truck and delivered right to the shelves. The 5am is kind of early. The board can tell them to test this out from 5am next week for few days and you can give approval for the normal deliveries and we can request for them to do some sound testing or have one of our engineers wake up very early and observe it. They can have actual information to come back to the board. The engineer can do it for 1-2 days to see what the noise level is.

Chairman Tyler- That was an excellent suggestion. What else do we got before we open to public?

Mr. Pobega- Is this needed 7 days a week or is it just week days?

Mr. Liszewski- It is typically Monday-Saturday. Sunday's we have minimal deliveries probably about 3-4 trailers. Sunday is morning hours. The other six days it would be 4-5 O'clock.

Attorney Vella- Sunday mornings you don't need it. Monday –Saturday you are hoping for the 5am and the evening hours. Is that 7 days a week or you don't need it on Saturday or Sunday nights.

Mr. Liszewski- We close our employees are out of the building by 8PM so it would not be necessary on Saturdays or Sundays.

Chairman Tyler- Your ask is 5am start Monday-Saturday and 10 PM finish Monday –Friday. You currently have 6am-8:30am when your able to actually restock in the morning so basically 2 ½ hours.

Mr. Liszewski- It is just not restocking it is also moving freight off the dock to the floor.

Chairman Tyler- I am talking about a period where you can actively operate your dock and bring stuff into the store because it doesn't interfere with customers. You also have 2 ½ hours at the end of the day currently. That would be your dock can operate from 6pm-830pm but at that time your store is still open.

Mr. Liszewski- That is correct.

Chairman Tyler- The store closes and you have 2 ½ hours after that where people can operate. Essentially in my mind you have 5 hours of stocking time right now and you are asking for five more hours of stocking time.

Mr. Liszewski- Correct.

Mr. Pobega- Can a trailer be left between the hours of 9-10 pm and then be unloaded in the morning without having the tractor part of it?

Mr. Liszewski- That would be a security concern.

Chairman Tyler- I would like to open the floor for public comment.

Citizen Hearing:

(Attorney Vella swore in all citizens before testimony)

Ed Huber- 5 Stanford Drive- I am the furthest from Costco being the third house on Stanford Drive. I have a great buffer zone and Costco did a great job from the initial plan. My only concern is extending the hours. I can appreciate your logistics in moving things around and safety. It seems like the biggest argument is getting the water first thing in the morning. Bottom line is you are gaining five hours that is a lot of hours. How many people do you have working in your normal hours for unloading.

Mr. Liszewski- I have one forklift driver that unloads.

Mr. Huber- I agree with Mike it is just water. If it were to do with refrigeration then I really have a concern.

Mr. Liszewski- Usually the water trucks are our first deliveries because they are coming so far from up north. Having the ability to receive one hour earlier is two tractor trailer loads we can eliminate right off the dock.

Mr. DeMatteo – You have five doors and only one driver why don't you just hire more drivers.

Mr. Liszewski- You can't have multiple drivers coming out at different times out of trailers. They also have to stage. It is a big safety issue.

Mr. Bace- With all due respect I disagree with that statement.

Mr. Liszewski- I have one driver that comes and off loads the trailers he puts it off to the dock and I have one operator off an electric power jack that runs the freight to the floor.

Mr. Bace- You don't have sufficient man power.

Mr. Liszewski- I disagree.

Chairman Tyler- Mr. Huber you haven't stated an issue with it being earlier so do you hear activity early in the morning? If it becomes earlier is that sound problem for you?

Mr. Huber- I am not concerned about myself I am concerned about the people who did not come here that will be affected. I don't hear it that much.

Chairman Tyler- What about at night? Is there sound or lights?

Mr. Huber-Not from where I am at. The only thing I have ever heard was when you back up the beep beep.

Mr. Liszewski- The tractor trailers.

Mr. Pobega- How long have you been there?

Mr. Huber – Since 1986.

Mr. Pobega- Has there been any problems before the hours changed going from 5 to 6am?

Mr. Huber- I never had any problems.

Jeffrey Boyd- 60 Fleetwood Drive- I want to get clarification with the significant increase in hours. You are talking 40% more hours. What studies did you perform that warrants 40% more hours? What did you do and where is the documentation for that?

Mr. Liszewski- I can't speak of any documentation but I have been in 8 or 9 different locations and I have had enough time to realize and see how the general operation works. It is not a 40% increase in hours it is just having the same amount of time. It is only one extra hour in the morning which is given us 2 more tractor trailers to unload.

Mr. Boyd- You mentioned safety but what provisions do you have as far as policies and procedures that deal with safety on that dock area that you are saying the master minds that were here 15 years ago they have had to have looked at other Costco's before they decided what they wanted to do here. Were they that far off?

Mr. Liszewski- I think our business has changed substantially. We have gotten a lot busier the last 10-11 years.

Mr. Boyd- Why wouldn't they have people from back then here to show the reasons for this strategy? If we pass this then what else are we getting ourselves into?

Mr. Liszewski- I can assure you I do not have any hidden agenda with it.

Chairman Tyler- Is it easy to hear the activity?

Mr. Boyd- There is noise to the back of our house at approximately 6:15-6:30 am. Sounds like garage door openings which occurs every morning. You can hear with inside your house.

Chairman Tyler- At night is it the same or different.

Mr. Boyd- You really can't tell. The activity in the morning is different from the night time at your home. There is more going on at night the morning are more quiet at your house so you hear more.

Antonio Bernard- 27 Stanford Drive- From where my house is to the docks it is very muffled but what I do hear are the trucks. The trucks are basically in my back yard after the hours screeching tires. I have been here since 1987. They had trees when their first built Costco that were on the mound that were supposed to block noise but there are no more trees on the mound.

Mr. DeMatteo- What happened to the trees?

Mr. Bernard- They died and they should have been replaced but they were not. They are idling back near the mound and what you are going to find is truck debris back there. It is coming from the trucks. Sometimes I hear noise at 5:30 am and sometimes I hear it at 8:30 PM because he missed the dock so he is not leaving so they hang out all night.

Mr. Cahill- Costco has control over the yellow outline and their trees and berm are planted and maintained. That is not Costco's property where you can see the trucks from your home.

Chairman Tyler- Mr. Bernard your issue is with the trucks showing up and being in proximity to your property but they are not actually on the Costco property. They are servicing Costco and it is still a problem for you.

Attorney Vella- That is an issue the Board can at least temp to deal with. The trucks are for Costco and they are not for the movie theater at that hour of the morning. We may want to eventually discuss either the banning of trucks being parked over night or designating an area on Costco site East of the building.

Chairman Tyler- Mr. Liszewski- You are familiar with where the people queue how much control do you have over that? That development parcel no one should be in there and maybe there is a way we can rope it off or something but we would rather not want to do that. If you were demonstrating that was not happening then Mr. Bernard would not be here and fewer people would be complaining.

Mr. Liszewski- I can certainly look into monitoring it. I can see what trucks pull up and make sure they don't go back there. We can post signs.

Attorney Vella- If we are dealing with the same Poland Spring guy that comes every morning it would be very easy for Costco to identify to the driver and company where specifically they are to idle

Chairman Tyler- Do you employee security staff in the morning and in the evenings?

Mr. Liszewski- We do at dusk.

Chairman Tyler- Then they can tell them where to go.

Attorney Vella- As a condition of the approval we can advise them to park in a certain area. If they violate it they are in violation of the site plan.

Chairman Tyler- I am not convinced that adding five hours to your ability to deliver is the solution. There has to be a combination of things and we have to address the real concerns of our citizens.

Mr. Bernard- As an ex store manager from way back when offloading and on loading is critical to any good business. If we want to give him some hours don't do it in the morning do it in the evening because we are already up.

Steven Dalton- 51 Fleetwood Drive- I live on the opposite side of the street from Costco. I don't have a concern with the later hours my concern is with the 5am start time. You do hear noise from the trucks even with the berm and the trees. I am up at 6 am running at least 3 times a week and I will hear the trucks. I don't understand how the board can go forward with this application and approve without some kind of study on the noise impact. We heard testimony that there is none. We heard testimony that there is no noise but the engineer is not an expert on noise issues. I don't understand how the board will go forward without a study being done. I would think the board would need to have some type of study done to assess what the noise impact is at. There is noise despite the good efforts that have been done to try and buffer the noise. I am also a little concern that Costco doesn't own that other parcel and it is a subdivision and it could be developed.

Attorney Vella- There is a parcel site that has approval for 15-20 years for some kind of retail establishment.

Chairman Tyler- There may have been one or two applications that came in over that entire period but nothing has been built there. Yes someday somebody might come in and we will give them the same process that you are in right now.

Mr. Dalton- If that does happen then that is a potential noise issue also. The earlier hour has a greater impact on my peace and quiet and enjoyment in the community. The testimony was this is the only Costco location that they know of with a restriction and there has to be a reason for that. The board placed that restriction on Costco obviously for the same concerns we are talking about tonight. I did not hear any testimony as to what that record was and why it should be changed. There had to be reasons why the board made this unique situation of placing a restriction that no other Costco has. What were those reasons and why should they be changed now. I am not discounting that there is concern for employee safety and I think that is a legitimate concern but I did not hear any testimony to substantiate that. There was no assessment done or comparison of what type of impacts.

Chairman Tyler- Those were very good comments. Obviously mornings are a problem for you. How much of an issue might extending the evening hours be?

Mr. Dalton- I have no issue with the evening hours.

Gerard McKeever- 52 Fleetwood Drive- I am in Costco's backyard. I agree whole heartedly with Mr. Dalton's statement. All I hear is beep beep beep all the time from the forklifts and the trucks. I hear the truck noise the truck breaks and the truck banging up against the building. In the winter time it is amplified because of the dry air. In the summer time it may be less because I hear the air conditioners on their roof top. Getting it at 5am will just not make life happy. I don't think Costco is going to fold up and move out because we don't give them that 5am time.

Chairman Tyler- What about extending the evening hours?

Mr. McKeever- 10 O'clock to me is a long time. They have been living on the hours they were given. Personally for me 10 O"clock is late. I have very quiet neighbors. I can give them to 8 O'clock I would say 9 O'clock would be too late.

Bill Shewan- 28 Mason Drive- I don't live in the area but the conversation I heard was strictly around the queuing process. The queuing process involves employees, space and safety. What study have you done on the queuing process other than a time element.

Mr. DeMatteo- I do sympathize with Costco on this. You might want to consider carrying this and think about hiring some additional employees before we push this. Once we vote on this it is done.

Mr. Liszewski- We have a process in receiving we stagger our trailers every half hour to bring them through so we can accurately receive them, safely unload them and run them off to the floor. I invite you to come to my building and I will be happy to show you the narrow corridor and where these forklifts exit the receiving dock and where they go and unload to run it off to the main floor. We have to receive it accurately but at the same point you cannot have multiple drivers coming in and out of lifts unsynchronized at different times.

Mr. Bace- I respectfully disagree. If you have two forklift operators and two trucks coming in and you tell me you have five bays and only one truck why build five bays. You are asking for more time because you only have one operator.

Mr. Liszewski- We do bring in more then one truck at certain times but from a safety standpoint we don't do that.

Mr. DeMatteo- Have you done a safety study?

Mr. Liszewski- No I have not.

Mr. Bace- Does Costco have a safety committee?

Mr. Liszewski- Yes we do.

Attorney Schiller- The issue is Costco cannot move the products on the floor after 8:30 AM. So the time period between 8:30 AM and 6:00 PM at night all the products that are being delivered to Costco are being queued and piled. That is the fundamental problem at this point not the number of forklifts.

Attorney Vella- If you don't bring product onto the floors while it is open for customers that means that from 8:30AM to 8:45 you don't bring anything to the floor. Forget about the 5am hour. You want more opportunity to stock more products in this back room. If you are asking deliveries from 6-7PM where are they putting the product they can't put it on the floor because it is open for customers. That is one hour they are adding to put stuff in the back. 7-8pm they are asking for that hour.

Mr. Liszewksi- It is not 6pm-7pm and 7pm to 8pm. predominantly it is 8:30 pm when we can really start to receive at night. That is the key time. 6-8pm still not do us any good.

Mr. Pobega- You want to take the palette right off the truck and put it right on the floor.

Mr. Liszewski- Exactly.

Attorney Schiller- The 6-8 time period while it is being asked for that is not the material time period to solving Costco's problem right now. We are talking about the 8:30pm to 10pm time window which would be the material time period to give that extra time to go from the truck to the floor.

Attorney Vella- Are you amendable in giving up the 5am hour?

Mr. Liszewski- Yes certainly

Attorney Vella- What does the board want to do at this point. The applicant is willing to amend their application to exclude the 5am-6am hour. They also do not need evening hours for Saturday and Sundays. The application in that sense is Monday-Friday extending their deliveries from 6pm to 10pm is their request. Why don't we let them run a test from 6pm to 10pm we for a couple of days a week and have our engineer there. They can come back and issue a report on it. We will start this application during the week of April 22-May 3, 2013 permitted to do it from 6pm to 10 p.m. Engineer will be on site randomly. This is the notice for the public. We will reconvene this at the May 16, 2013 at 7:30 p.m. meeting at town hall. We do not need a vote.

ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION: Create a sub-committee consisting of 4 planning board members to make suggestions for the implementation of the adopted 2030 Vision Plan.

Chairman Tyler- I have spoken to Deputy Mayor DiNardo, Mr. Glackin, Mr. Pobega and myself would be the four members. The purpose of it is to take all of our learning's from the 2030 Vision and make a real application of it. Make recommendations to the Township Committee regarding potential zoning, potential improvements and things we would do that are directly related to the recommendations that come out of the Vision Plan. Mr. Glackin has a lot of experience in housing that is the business he is in. We have some issues in town and we need to make sure our planning aligns with the issues we have and figure it out and hopefully come up with a new housing plan. This will give us a real step forward and protect our open space. That is my recommendation.

Bill Shewan- 28 Mason Drive- I think this is a result of the minutes that were in the March 19, 2013 Township meeting that this is more directed for the Preliminary investigation of the redevelopment of specific blocks and lots.

Attorney Vella- That is something completely different than what we are talking about. That is looking for an area in need of redevelopment.

Mr. Shewan- These lots are cited in the Vision Plan can I address that?

Sharon Keegan- We do not have this on the agenda until April 18, 2013. I just received this from the Township Committee. No one is even prepared to discuss this tonight. Township Committee is authorizing the Planning Board to investigate.

Chairman Tyler- What we are talking about tonight is the planning board being proactive so we can stay ahead of the Township Committee and one of the focus areas included Stone Road Meadows.

Mr. Shewan- I was involved in the vision process and as such I am a member of Hazlet Area Quality of Life. We have an interest in the largest parcel which is Stone Road Meadows I would ask that you authorize that I can at least meet with a subcommittee or committee and give our feelings of what transpired in the past.

Attorney Vella- I am cutting you off since we are dealing a particular parcel that we are going to present for a hearing on redevelopment and we haven't even gotten that far. I am going to advise the board not to discuss that parcel it is subject to a public hearing like any other application.

Mr. Shewan- I will word it a different way. In view of the fact I was involved in the vision process excluding that one parcel and HAQLA has an interest in the environment and the improvement of the town can we be consulted with regard to the process you are going through?

Mr. Lavan- I understand were Bill is coming from and where he is going there was an article in the Asbury Park Press today there was a Freehold meeting with Lillian Burry you should have been in Freehold today and asked her about the farmland.

Chairman Tyler- Mr. Shewan the subcommittee is first going to meet then we are going to figure out what exactly our recommendations might be and then I will determine whether that is appropriate to share with outside groups that are not part of the this board. It is hard for me to react to your request. I am not saying no and I am not saying yes.

Mr. Shewan- Thank you for your consideration.

Mr. DeMatteo- I would like the sub commission to consider anything that might be able to be done with the Cresci Greenhouse in Raritan Valley. This is probably the last parcel in the Valley that can be considered green space.

Gene Geer- 558 Beers Street- Currently the Stone Road Meadows does not fit in the criteria for a county park.

Chairman Tyler- This is not the evening to bring this up and get into this. We are just trying to follow up on the 2030 Vision Plan to make recommendations.

Motion to Close Citizens hearing:

Offered: Mr. Vignola 2nd Mr. Glackin

Voice Vote: Yes

Motion to Adjourn:

Offered: Mr. Vignola 2nd Mr. Glackin

Voice Vote: Yes

Next Meeting April 18, 2013

Sharon A. Keegan
Administrative Officer